2012 (Kouwenhoven, Delft) Science **336,** 1003, 2012.



- Since 2012, new fabrication developments have allowed to produce much improved samples, very good semiconductor/superconductor contacts and much cleaner data (hard gaps, etc).
- Zero bias anomalies are extremely robust.



2012 (Kouwenhoven, Delft) Science **336,** 1003, 2012.





 V_{SD} (mV)

- Since 2012, new fabrication developments have allowed to produce much improved samples, very good semiconductor/superconductor contacts and much cleaner data (hard gaps, etc).
- Zero bias anomalies are extremely robust.

2012 (Kouwenhoven, Delft) Science **336,** 1003, 2012.

400 200 -200 -200 -200 -200 -0.25 0 0 0.25 0 0.5 0.5 0.75 -205 -0.75 -205 -0.75 -205 -0.75 -205 -0.75 -0.

- Since 2012, new fabrication developments have allowed to produce much improved samples, very good semiconductor/superconductor contacts and much cleaner data (hard gaps, etc).
- Zero bias anomalies are extremely robust.

Breakthrough epitaxial AI-InAs wires 2015 (Peter Krogstrup, Jesper Nygard, Charlie Marcus @Copenhagen)



2012 (Kouwenhoven, Delft) Science 336, 1003, 2012.



- Since 2012, new fabrication developments have allowed to produce much improved samples, very good semiconductor/superconductor contacts and much cleaner data (hard gaps, etc).
- Zero bias anomalies are extremely robust.

epitaxial Al-InAs heterostructure 2016 (Marcus, Copenhagen) Phys. Rev. Lett. 119, 176805 (2017)



2012 (Kouwenhoven, Delft) Science 336, 1003, 2012.



epitaxial Al-InSb wires (Kouwenhoven, Delft) Nature 548 434 (2017)



These wires also show very good Andreev enhancement and 2e²/h ZBAs were claimed (Hao Zhang et al, Nature March 2018)

- Since 2012, new fabrication developments have allowed to produce much improved samples, very good semiconductor/superconductor contacts and much cleaner data (hard gaps, etc).
- Zero bias anomalies are extremely robust.



LETTER

Retraction two years later (in March 2020)



Quantized Majorana conductance

Hao Zhang¹*, Chun–Xiao Liu²*, Sasa Gazibegovic³*, Di Xu¹, John A. Logan⁴, Guanzhong Wang¹, Nick van Loo¹, Jouri D. S. Bommer¹, Michiel W. A. de Moor¹, Diana Car³, Roy L. M. Op het Veld³, Petrus J. van Veldhoven³, Sebastian Krening³, Marcel A. Verheijen^{3,5}, Mihir Pendharkar⁶, Daniel J. Pennachio⁴, Borzoyeh Shojaei^{4,7}, Joon Sue Lee⁷, Chris J. Palmstr m^{4,6,7}, Erik P. A. M. Bakkers³, S. Das Sarma² & Leo P. Kouwenhoven^{1,8}

Majorana zero-modes-a type of localized quasiparticle-hold great promise for topological quantum computing¹. Tunnelling spectroscopy in electrical transport is the primary tool for identifying the presence of Majorana zero-modes, for instance as a zero-bias peak in differential conductance². The height of the Majorana zero-bias peak is predicted to be quantized at the universal conductance value of $2e^2/h$ at zero temperature³ (where e is the charge of an electron and h is the Planck constant), as a direct consequence of the famous Majorana symmetry in which a particle is its own antiparticle. The Majorana symmetry protects the quantization against disorder, interactions and variations in the tunnel coupling³⁻⁵. Previous experiments⁶, however, have mostly shown zero-bias peaks much smaller than $2e^2/h$, with a recent observation⁷ of a peak height close to $2e^2/h$. Here we report a quantized conductance plateau at $2e^2/h$ in the zero-bias conductance measured in indium antimonide semiconductor nanowires covered with an aluminium superconducting shell. The height of our zerobias peak remains constant despite changing parameters such as the magnetic field and tunnel coupling, indicating that it is a quar azed conductance plateau. We distinguish this quantized Majoran 20. from possible non-Majorana origins by investigating its robust. to electric and magnetic fields as well as its temperature pendence The observation of a quantized conductance plateau rongly supports the existence of Majorana zero-modes in the sciem, consequently paving the way for future braid ng experiments that could lead to topological quantum computing

A semiconductor nanowire coupled to a superior ductor can be tuned into a topological superconduction ith two Majorana zeromodes localized at the wire ends^{1,8,9}. Tunn lling to a Majorana mode will show a zero-energy state in the unnering density-of-states, that is, a zero-bias peak (ZBP) in the differential conductance $(dI/dV)^{2,6}$. This tunnelling process is in 'A nervou Action', in which an incoming electron is reflected as a hole conticle-hole symmetry dictates that the zero-energy unit ling amplitudes of electrons and holes are equal, resulting in perfect contant transmission with a ZBP height quantized at $2e^2/h$ (refs 3, 4, 1*s*), irrespective of the precise tunnelling strength³⁻⁵. The toporanenature of this perfect Andreev reflection is a direct result of the coll-known Majorana symmetry property 'particle equals antip, rticle'

This is a bobust conductance quantization has not yet been observed 713,14 . Instead, most of the ZBPs have a height considerably less than $2e^2/h$. This discrepancy was first explained by thermal averaging $^{15-18}$, but that explanation does not hold when the peak width exceeds the thermal broadening (about $3.5k_BT$) 13,14 . In that case, other averaging mechanisms, such as dissipation¹⁹, have been invoked. The main source of dissipation is a finite quasiparticle density-of-states within the superconducting gap, often r ferrento as a 'soft gap'. Substantial advances have been achieved in 'haro, org' the gap by improving the quality of materials, eliminating disorder and interface roughness^{20,21}, and better cor role oring derice processing^{22,23}, all guided by a more detailed theorytical adverstanding²⁴. We have recently solved all these dissipation and bisorder issues²¹, and here we report the resulting improvements in elegrical transport leading to the elusive quantization of the Major na ZBP.

Figure 1a shows a coograph of a fabricated device and schematics of the measurement set-to. An InSb nanowire (grey) is partially covered (two out of six fact proy a nin superconducting aluminium shell (green)²¹. The 'tunne, tes' (coral red) are used to induce a tunnel barrier in the proceed segment between the left electrical contact (yellow) and he Annell. The right contact is used to drain the current to ground. The chemical potential in the segment covered with Al can be used by applying voltages to the two long 'super-gates' (purple).

Tran ort spectroscopy is shown in Fig. 1b, which displays dI/dVfunction of voltage bias V and magnetic field B (aligned with the na. Are axis), while fixed voltages are applied to the tunnel- and super-gates. As B increases, two levels detach from the gap edge at about 0.2 meV), merge at zero bias and form a robust ZBP. This is consistent with the Majorana theory: a ZBP is formed after the Zeeman energy closes the trivial superconducting gap and re-opens a topological gap^{8,9}. The gap re-opening is not visible in a measurement of the local density-of-states because the tunnel coupling to these bulk states is small²⁵. Moreover, the finite length (about $1.2 \,\mu m$) of the proximitized segment (that is, the part that is superconducting because of the proximity effect from the superconducting Al coating) results in discrete energy states, turning the trivial-to-topological phase transition into a smooth crossover²⁶. Figure 1c shows two line-cuts from Fig. 1b extracted at 0T and 0.88T. Importantly, the height of the ZBP reaches the quantized value of $2e^2/h$. The line-cut at zero bias in the lower panel of Fig. 1b shows that the ZBP height remains close to $2e^2/h$ over a sizable range in B field (0.75–0.92 T). Beyond this range, the height drops, most probably because of a closure of the superconducting gap in the bulk Al shell.

We note that the sub-gap conductance at B = 0 (black curve, left panel, Fig. 1c) is not completely suppressed down to zero, reminiscent of a soft gap. In this case, however, this finite sub-gap conductance does not reflect any finite sub-gap density-of-states in the proximitized wire. It arises from Andreev reflection (that is, transport by dissipationless Cooper pairs) due to a high tunnelling transmission, which is evident from the above-gap conductance (d*I*/d*V* for V > 0.2 mV) being larger than e^2/h . As this softness does not result from dissipation, the Majorana peak height should still reach the quantized value²⁷. In Extended Data Fig. 1, we show that this device tuned into a low-transmission regime,

¹QuTech and Kavli Institute of NanoScience, Delft University of Technology, 2600 GA Delft, The Netherlands. ²Condensed Matter Theory Center and Joint Quantum Institute, Department of Physics, University of Maryland, College Park, Maryland 20742, USA. ³Department of Applied Physics, Eindhoven University of Technology, 5600 MB Eindhoven, The Netherlands. ⁴Materials Engineering, University of California Santa Barbara, California 93106, USA. ⁵Philips Innovation Services Eindhoven, High Tech Campus 11, 5656AE Eindhoven, The Netherlands. ⁶Electrical and Computer Engineering, University of California Santa Barbara, Santa Barbara, California 93106, USA. ⁷California NanoSystems Institute, University of California Santa Barbara, Santa Barbara, California 93106, USA. ⁸Microsoft Station Q Delft, 2600 GA Delft, The Netherlands. ^{*}These authors contributed equally to this work.

Retraction two years later (in March 2020)



Large zero-bias peaks in InSb-AI hybrid semiconductorsuperconductor nanowire devices

Hao Zhang^{*},^{1, 2, 3} Michiel W.A. de Moor^{*},^{1, 2} Jouri D.S. Bommer^{*},^{1, 2} Di Xu,^{1, 2} Guanzhong
Wang,^{1, 2} Nick van Loo,^{1, 2} Chun-Xiao Liu,^{1, 2, 4} Sasa Gazibegovic,⁵ John A. Logan,⁶ Diana Car,⁵
Roy L. M. Op het Veld,⁵ Petrus J. van Veldhoven,⁵ Sebastian Koelling^a,⁵ Marcel A. Verheijen,⁵
Mihir Pendharkar,⁷ Daniel J. Pennachio,⁶ Borzoyeh Shojaei,^{6, 8} Joon Sue Lee^b,⁸ Chris J.
Palmstrøm,^{6, 7, 8} Erik P.A.M. Bakkers, ⁵ S. Das Sarma,⁴ Leo P. Kouwenhoven^{1, 2, 9[†]}



Zero energy crossings of Andreev levels and/or smooth confinement can mimic this behavior (reported theoretically many years before the retraction).

THE NAGGING QUESTION:

IS THIS ZERO MODE A MAJORANA OR IS IT AN ANDREEV LEVEL?



THE NAGGING QUESTION:

IS THIS ZERO MODE A MAJORANA OR IS IT AN ANDREEV LEVEL?





NATURE REVIEWS | PHYSICS

Check for updates

From Andreev to Majorana bound states in hybrid superconductor— semiconductor nanowires

Elsa Prada[®]¹[™], Pablo San-Jose[®]², Michiel W. A. de Moor³, Attila Geresdi³, Eduardo J. H. Lee¹, Jelena Klinovaja⁴, Daniel Loss⁴, Jesper Nygård[®]⁵, Ramón Aguado² and Leo P. Kouwenhoven^{3,6}

Abstract | Inhomogeneous superconductors can host electronic excitations, known as Andreev bound states (ABSs), below the superconducting energy gap. With the advent of topological superconductivity, a new kind of zero-energy ABS with exotic qualities, known as a Majorana bound state (MBS), has been discovered. A special property of MBS wavefunctions is their nonlocality, which, together with non-Abelian braiding, is the key to their promise in topological quantum computation. We focus on hybrid superconductor–semiconductor nanowires as a flexible and promising experimental platform to realize one-dimensional topological superconductivity and MBSs. We review the main properties of ABSs and MBSs, state-of-the-art techniques for their detection and theoretical progress beyond minimal models, including different types of robust zero modes that may emerge without a band-topological transition.

Nature Reviews Physics volume 2, pages 575–594 (2020)

NATURE REVIEWS | PHYSICSvolume 2, pages 575-594 (2020)

ICMM_ CSIC

From Andreev to Majorana bound states in hybrid superconductor— semiconductor nanowires

Elsa Prada¹^M, Pablo San-Jose², Michiel W. A. de Moor³, Attila Geresdi³, Eduardo J. H. Lee¹, Jelena Klinovaja⁴, Daniel Loss⁴, Jesper Nygård⁵, Ramón Aguado² and Leo P. Kouwenhoven^{3,6}

Type	Subtype	Bulk topology	Spatial Overlap of Majorana components	Spatial extension of Majorana components	Zero energy pinning	Non-Abelian braiding
ABSs	Standard: SO=0, Vz=0	trivial	complete	spread across junction/ normal region	no	no
	SO≠0, Vz <vz<sup>c</vz<sup>	trivial	partial	spread across junction/ normal region	no	no
	strong SO, Vz <vz<sup>c</vz<sup>	trivial	partial	spread across junction/ normal region	only vs. V _Z , rest fine-tuned	no
	coupled multiband + short-range inhomogeneity	trivial	high	spread across inhomogeneity	approximate	no
	Shiba state	trivial	complete	localized to impurity	no	no
MBSs	Long (L»ξ _M , V _Z >V _Z ^c)	nontrivial	exponentially suppressed	localized to edges	yes	yes
	Short (L≲ξ _M , V _Z >V _Z ^c)	nontrivial	partial	localized to edges but overlapping	no (Majorana oscillations)	no
Smooth zero modes	Smoothly confined S	trivial	partial	localized to smooth edge	yes	yes (parametric)
	Smooth S'S/NS junction (nontopological MBS/ps-MBS/ quasi-MBS/EP-MBS)	trivial	partial	localized to smooth junction	yes	yes (parametric)

Finite Δ : quasiparticle excitations above the gap induce Kondo correlations



- PEAKS IN ANDREEV CONDUCTANCE dI/dV MEASURE SUBGAP <u>EXCITATIONS</u>
- CHANGES IN THE GROUND STATE ARE SIGNALED AS ZERO-ENERGY CROSSINGS OF SUCH SUBGAP STATES



- PEAKS IN ANDREEV CONDUCTANCE dl/dV MEASURE SUBGAP <u>EXCITATIONS</u>
- CHANGES IN THE GROUND STATE ARE SIGNALED AS ZERO-ENERGY CROSSINGS OF SUCH SUBGAP STATES



ES=excited state GS=ground state



- PEAKS IN ANDREEV CONDUCTANCE dI/dV MEASURE SUBGAP EXCITATIONS
- CHANGES IN THE GROUND STATE ARE SIGNALED AS ZERO-ENERGY CROSSINGS OF SUCH SUBGAP STATES



ES=excited state GS=ground state



The energy of the subgap state (transition) decreases as we move towards the boundary by varying some external parameter (here the QD level position)

- PEAKS IN ANDREEV CONDUCTANCE dI/dV MEASURE SUBGAP EXCITATIONS
- CHANGES IN THE GROUND STATE ARE SIGNALED AS ZERO-ENERGY CROSSINGS OF SUCH SUBGAP STATES



ES=excited state GS=ground state



Eventually it reaches zero at the boundary: **zero** energy crossing

- PEAKS IN ANDREEV CONDUCTANCE dI/dV MEASURE SUBGAP EXCITATIONS
- CHANGES IN THE GROUND STATE ARE SIGNALED AS ZERO-ENERGY CROSSINGS OF SUCH SUBGAP STATES



ES=excited state GS=ground state

The ground state **has changed**

Spin-resolved Andreev levels and parity crossings in hybrid superconductor-semiconductor nanostructures

Eduardo J. H. Lee¹, Xiaocheng Jiang², Manuel Houzet¹, Ramón Aguado³, Charles M. Lieber² and Silvano De Franceschi¹*

Experimentally, this is seen as resonates in Andreev conductance (red lines) that **cross zero voltage**

Quantum phase transition: when the **subgap states cross zero energy**, the ground state changes parity

NON-TRIVIAL GATE DEPENDENCE OF THE ZEEMAN SPLITTING

nature nanotechnology

ARTICLES PUBLISHED ONLINE: 15 DECEMBER 2013 | DOI: 10.1038/NNANO.2013.267

Spin-resolved Andreev levels and parity crossings in hybrid superconductor-semiconductor nanostructures

Eduardo J. H. Lee¹, Xiaocheng Jiang², Manuel Houzet¹, Ramón Aguado³, Charles M. Lieber² and Silvano De Franceschi¹*

PEAKS IN ANDREEV CONDUCTANCE dI/dV MEASURE THESE SUBGAP <u>EXCITATIONS</u>

0 |S > |D > |S >

B = 0

Zeeman splitting is **gate dependent**. Full agreement with theory.

Vg

 $B \neq 0$

icmm_ csic_

ZERO-BIAS ANOMALIES AS A FUNCTION OF MAGNETIC FIELD MIMIC MAJORANAS!

Nature Nano 9, 79 (2014)

NOVEL GEOMETRIES: FULL SHELL NANOWIRES

$$\Delta(\varphi) = \Delta(\Phi) \exp(in\varphi)$$

Fluxoid $\frac{\hbar}{2e} \oint \partial_{\mathbf{r}} \varphi d\mathbf{r} = \Phi + \frac{m}{2e} \oint \mathbf{v}_s d\mathbf{r} = n\Phi_0$

Little-Parks

RESEARCH ARTICLE

TOPOLOGICAL MATTER

Flux-induced topological superconductivity in full-shell nanowires

S. Vaitiekėnas¹, G. W. Winkler², B. van Heck², T. Karzig², M.-T. Deng¹, K. Flensberg¹, L. I. Glazman³, C. Nayak², P. Krogstrup¹, R. M. Lutchyn²*, C. M. Marcus¹*

Vaitiekėnas *et al.*, *Science* **367**, eaav3392 (2020) 27 March 2020

NOVEL GEOMETRIES: FULL SHELL NANOWIRES

Vaitiekėnas *et al.*, *Science* **367**, eaav3392 (2020)

RESEARCH ARTICLE

TOPOLOGICAL MATTER

Α

Flux-induced topological superconductivity in full-shell nanowires

S. Vaitiekėnas¹, G. W. Winkler², B. van Heck², T. Karzig², M.-T. Deng¹, K. Flensberg¹, L. I. Glazman³, C. Nayak², P. Krogstrup¹, R. M. Lutchyn²*, C. M. Marcus¹*

Valentini et al., Science 373, 82-88 (2021)

MESOSCOPIC PHYSICS

Nontopological zero-bias peaks in full-shell nanowires induced by flux-tunable Andreev states

Marco Valentini¹*, Fernando Peñaranda², Andrea Hofmann¹+, Matthias Brauns¹‡, Robert Hauschild¹, Peter Krogstrup³, Pablo San-Jose², Elsa Prada^{2,4}, Ramón Aguado²*, Georgios Katsaros¹*

Andrea Hofmann^{1,6}, Jordi Arbiol^{4,5}, Ramón Aguado³, Pablo San-Jose³[™] & Georgios Katsaros¹[™]

Accepted: 22 September 2022

Received: 24 March 2022

NOVEL GEOMETRIES: FULL SHELL NANOWIRES

icmm csic-

- Distinguishing Majorana bound states from other subgap states from non-topological origin (Andreev,Shiba) in current spectroscopy experiments is probably hopeless.
- "Zero bias anomaly" endless controversy....

 So far, only "bad news" in the talk: Andreev/Shiba subgap levels can mimic Majoranas and it's almost impossible to unambiguously discern them using transport spectroscopy. Good News, while figuring out how to create and detect Majoranas we got two very important outputs:

- Amazing improvement in material growth of semi-super hybrids
- Very good understanding of the physics of NS junctions, superconducting quantum dots, and their subgap physics in these hybrids

We can use this progress to explore novel qubits using these hybrid platforms: NEXT

Article

Realization of a minimal Kitaev chain in coupled quantum dots

Tom Dvir^{1,2,4}, Guanzhong Wang^{1,2,4}, Nick van Loo^{1,2,4}, Chun-Xiao Liu^{1,2}, Grzegorz P. Mazur^{1,2}, Alberto Bordin^{1,2}, Sebastiaan L. D. ten Haaf^{1,2}, Ji-Yin Wang^{1,2}, David van Driel^{1,2}, Francesco Zatelli^{1,2}, Xiang Li^{1,2}, Filip K. Malinowski^{1,2}, Sasa Gazibegovic³, Ghada Badawy³, Erik P. A. M. Bakkers³, Michael Wimmer^{1,2} & Leo P. Kouwenhoven^{1,2}

RIGHT QUANTUM DOT

(|00> - |11>)/ 2

 $(|00\rangle + |11\rangle)/2$

.

(

Nature | Vol 614 | 16 February 2023 | **445**

Article

Realization of a minimal Kitaev chain in coupled quantum dots

Nature | Vol 614 | 16 February 2023 | **445**

icmm csic-

Article

Realization of a minimal Kitaev chain in coupled quantum dots

Nature | Vol 614 | 16 February 2023 | **445**

icmm- csic-

11

Article

0

 γ_L

 μ_L

B

 γ_L^{D}

Realization of a minimal Kitaev chain in coupled quantum dots

InSb

Al+Pt

InSb

HfO,

Au

Nature | Vol 614 | 16 February 2023 | 445

BACKTO MAJORANAS!

icmm csic

PHYSICAL REVIEW B 86, 134528 (2012)

icmm- csic-

Parity qubits and poor man's Majorana bound states in double quantum dots

-icmm-csic-

$$H_{K} = \mu_{1}c_{1}^{\dagger}c_{1} + \mu_{2}c_{2}^{\dagger}c_{2} + (tc_{1}^{\dagger}c_{2} + \Delta c_{1}c_{2} + H.c.)$$

$$H_{K} = \mu_{1}c_{1}^{\dagger}c_{1} + \mu_{2}c_{2}^{\dagger}c_{2} + (tc_{1}^{\dagger}c_{2} + \Delta c_{1}c_{2} + H.c.)$$
Single particle basis $H_{K} = \frac{1}{2}\Psi^{\dagger}h_{K}\Psi$

$$\Psi = (c_{1}, c_{2}, c_{1}^{\dagger}, c_{2}^{\dagger})$$

$$h_{K} = \begin{pmatrix} \mu_{1} & t & 0 & \Delta \\ t & \mu_{2} & -\Delta & 0 \\ 0 & -\Delta & -\mu_{1} & -t \\ \Delta & 0 & -t & -\mu_{2} \end{pmatrix}$$

Zero energy solutions

$$\psi_1 = \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}} (1, 0, 1, 0) \to \gamma_1^A = \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}} (c_1 + c_1^{\dagger})$$

$$\psi_2 = \frac{i}{\sqrt{2}} (0, 1, 0, -1) \to \gamma_2^B = \frac{i}{\sqrt{2}} (c_2 - c_2^{\dagger})$$

icmm- csic-

$$H_{\rm K} = \mu_1 c_1^{\dagger} c_1 + \mu_2 c_2^{\dagger} c_2 + (t c_1^{\dagger} c_2 + \Delta c_1 c_2 + \text{H.c.})$$

Many body basis

|10
angle, |01
angle, |00
angle, |11
angle

-icmm-csic-

 $t = \Delta$

0

-5

 $|10\rangle - |01\rangle$

 $t > \Lambda$

f

µ_{RD} (а.u.)

-5

5

 $|00\rangle - |11\rangle$

 $t < \Delta$

0

-icmm- csic-

BACKTO MAJORANAS!

icmm- csic

