Nine years of iron superconductors, what have we learnt

E. Bascones

Instituto de Ciencia de Materiales de Madrid (ICMM-CSIC)











Outline

- □ Conventional vs non-conventional superconductors.
- Iron superconductors, basic properties & models
 - The materials
 - Non-universal phase diagrams
 - Band structure & multi-orbital character. Basic models

Electronic correlations in iron superconductors. Hund metal physics

Ordered phases

- The magnetic state
- Superconductivity: mechanism & order parameter
- The nematic state: spin & orbital interplay

Other issues

□ Summary and future prospects.



Introduction to superconductivity

- □ 1911. Discovery. Resistivity vanishes below a critical temperature Tc
- □ 1933. Meissner effect. Superconductors expel the magnetic fields
- □ 1957. BCS Theory for superconductivity. Phase transition. Cooper pairs which condense & electron-phonon mechanism

$$\begin{split} \Psi &= \prod_{\mathbf{k}=\mathbf{k}_{1},\cdots,\mathbf{k}_{N/2}} \left(u_{\mathbf{k}} + v_{\mathbf{k}} a_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow}^{\dagger} a_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow}^{\dagger} \right) |0\rangle \\ & E_{\mathbf{k}} \equiv \sqrt{\xi_{\mathbf{k}}^{2} + \Delta_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow}^{2}} \longrightarrow \text{Gap at the Fermi surface} \end{split}$$

Electrons have equal charge & repel each other, where is the attractive interaction coming from?

Which is the mechanism of superconductivity?



Conventional vs non-conventional superconductors

1957. BCS Theory for superconductivity. Cooper pairs which condense & electronphonon mechanism



In BCS theory the attraction between the electrons is mediated by the interaction with the vibrations of the atomic lattice (electron-phonon mechanism)



This mechanism works in many materials: The conventional superconductors

Non-conventional superconductors

Other possible sources of pairing were soon proposed: spin fluctuations, plasmons, ...:

Note that 3He is a superfluid mediated by ferromagnetic spin fluctuations



Superconducting materials



icmm

CSIC

Superconductivity in heavy fermion compounds

By PJRay - Own work, CC BY-SA 4.0, https://commons.wikimedia.org/w/index.php?curid=46193149

In 2008 it starts the iron age



Short after their discovery it was clear that superconductivity in iron based materials could not be explained by the electron-phonon mechanism



Iron superconductors: the materials, FeAs & FeSe layers



Fig:Hosono & Kuroki, Phys. C (2015), arXiv: 1504.04919

E. Bascones leni@icmm.csic.es



CaRbFe₄As₄ (P4/mmm)

1144-As

Iron superconductors: the materials, FeAs & FeSe layers



122-family (BaFe₂As₂, Sr₂As₂, ...)

Most studied compounds due to availability of single crystals

FeSe (11 family)

- In bulk and ambient pressure Tc=8 K
- Synthesized in monolayer form with higher Tc (65 K or above 100 K?)
- Phase diagram (nematic phase)
- Tiny Fermi surfaces. BEC-BCS crossover

Fig: Baek et al, Nat. Mat. 14, 210 (2015)





The phase diagram of early discovered iron superconductors



icmm

CSIC

High-Tc superconductivity in iron based materials: The phase diagram



The phase diagram of early discovered iron superconductors

Cuprates

Pnictides (FeAs systems)



The phase diagram of early discovered iron superconductors

Pnictides (FeAs)



Can we find new materials with higher Tc?

Are the physics of iron superconductors and that of cuprates related?

Which is the origin of the nematic phase?



De la Cruz et al, Nature 453, 899 (2008), Zhao et al, Nature Materials 7, 953 (2008)



To study the iron superconductors:

Systems under study

- Different families & compounds
- Role of hole & electron doping with different dopants
- Role of pressure
- Role of temperature
- Isovalent doping
- Role of disorder ...

Many techniques

- ARPES
- Resistivity
- Neutrons
- STM
- NMR
- Raman
- Optical conductivity
- Quantum oscillations
- X-ray
- Magnetic torque ...

Theory

- Ab-initio
- Microscopic models
- Effective models (different assumptions)
- Approximations: RPA, Hartree-Fock, Renormalization Group, Slave-spin DMFT
 - Landau-Ginzburg
 - Spectroscopic properties



The phase diagram of early discovered iron superconductors

- Which is the origin of the high-Tc superconductivity?
- Can we find new materials with higher Tc?
- Are the physics of iron superconductors and that of cuprates related?
- Which is the origin of the nematic phase?

Key issues:

- □ Correlations in iron superconductors
- Interplay between the spin and orbital degrees of freedom



The physics of high-Tc superconducting cuprates

CuO,





Repulsion in undoped cuprates is so strong that it can drive the system into an insulating state

But away from half-filling the system is always metallic



CSIC

The physics of high-Tc superconducting cuprates



- Proximity to antiferromagnetism
- Possible role of quantum criticality
- Possible role of anisotropic states

Cuprates: doping a Mott insulator in 2D

Are the strong (Mott) correlations a requisite for the high-Tc superconductivity?



Band structure & multi-orbital character.



cross the Fermi level



Tight-binding + interaction Hamiltonians treated in different approximations

Allow to study the strength of correlations & include the orbital degree of freedom



Tight-binding + interaction Hamiltonians treated in different approximations

In general only local interactions are included but some models include 1st nearest neighbors to discuss the nematic state of FeSe



$$\begin{split} H &= \sum_{i,j,\gamma,\beta,\sigma} t_{i,j}^{\gamma,\beta} c_{i,\gamma,\sigma}^{\dagger} c_{j,\beta,\sigma} + h.c. + U \sum_{j,\gamma} n_{j,\gamma,\uparrow} n_{j,\gamma,\downarrow} \\ &+ (U' - \frac{J_{\rm H}}{2}) \sum_{j,\gamma>\beta,\sigma,\tilde{\sigma}} n_{j,\gamma,\sigma} n_{j,\beta,\tilde{\sigma}} - 2J_{\rm H} \sum_{j,\gamma>\beta} \vec{S}_{j,\gamma} \vec{S}_{j,\beta} \\ &+ J' \sum_{j,\gamma\neq\beta} c_{j,\gamma,\uparrow}^{\dagger} c_{j,\gamma,\downarrow}^{\dagger} c_{j,\beta,\downarrow} c_{j,\beta,\uparrow} + \sum_{j,\gamma,\sigma} \epsilon_{\gamma} n_{j,\gamma,\sigma} \end{split}$$

Small crystal field differences



At least the 5 Fe d-orbitals are necessary to describe the electronic properties (maybe even more):

Undoped system 6 electrons in 5 orbitals



Mott insulators vs weakly correlated metals



Weakly interacting Metal:

Electrons delocalized in real space, localized in k-space. Description in terms of electronic bands Ordered phases: Fermi surface instabilities

Fig: Calderón et al, PRB, 80, 094531 (2009)



Mott Insulator:

Electrons localized in real space, delocalized in k-space. Spin models. Description as localized spins is meaningful Ordered phases: interactions between spins



Tight-binding + interaction Hamiltonians treated in different approximations Models with focus on electronic states close to the Fermi surface (k-space models), Itinerant description.

Spin models which assume that the electrons are localized, real space description



Basic models

Weakly correlated models. Focus on the Fermi surface bands close to the Fermi level (k-space description, assumes weakly correlated metal)



Localized Electrons. Focus on spin models (real space description, assumes localized electrons)

$$H_{J_1-J_2} = \frac{J_1}{|S|^2} \sum_{\langle i,j \rangle} \vec{S_i} \vec{S_j} + \frac{J_2}{|S|^2} \sum_{\langle \langle i,j \rangle \rangle} \vec{S_i} \vec{S_j}.$$

Heisenberg Hamiltonian to 1st and 2nd nearest neighbors (a J_3 term to 3rd nearest neighbors included to explain the Magnetic order of FeTe)

CSIC

icmm

Iron superconductors: Basic properties and models

- □ High-Tc superconductivity in materials with FeAs or FeSe layers. Many compounds belonging to at least 11 families. Tc up to 65 K or even aborve 100 K (monolayer FeSe)?
- The phase diagram is not unique. The most common phases are stripe antiferromagnetic, nematic phase, superconducting phase. Other magnetic orders (like double stripe in FeTe or C4 phase in hole-doped systems) have been observed. Some compounds show two superconducting domes.
- Phase diagram with common features to that of cuprates (but also important differences)
- □ Iron superconductors are multi-orbital systems.
- Different approaches to study these materials:
 - Multi-orbital interacting models
 - Low energy models (Fermi surface physics)
 - Spin models (localized electrons)



The physics of high-Tc superconducting cuprates



Mott insulator Localized system Spin models in Real space

Cuprates: doping a Mott insulator in 2D

Are the strong (Mott) correlations a requisite for the high-Tc superconductivity?



Correlations in iron superconductors



FeAs based superconductors

Does this mean that the electrons are not correlated in iron superconductors?



Strong correlations: enhanced mass

Many body states, important deviations from DFT predictions which is based on an independent particle description (band theory)

In some cases, the single-particle band description fails completely. Mott insulators: expected to be metals by band theory but insulators due to correlations

Fermi liquid: in most cases at low energies and temperatures it is still possible to describe the system in terms of single particle bands and excitations (quasiparticles) with renormalized properties (mass m*, specific heat, spin susceptibility, Drude weight ...)

Enhanced electronic mass m* as a measure of correlations



Correlations in iron superconductors



FeAs based superconductors

Does this mean that the electrons are not correlated in iron superconductors?

Mass enhancements in FeAs systems m* ~2-3 (in chalcogenides even larger)

Not clear which should be the best starting point to describe iron superconductors



So far dichotomy:

Fermi surface physics

Weak correlations Itinerant electrons No local moments

Raghu et al, PRB 77, 220503 (2008), Mazin et al, PRB 78, 085104 (2008), Chubukov et al, PRB 78, 134512 (2008), Cvetkovic & Tesanovic,EPL85, 37002 (2008)

Mott physics

Strong correlations Localized electrons Local Moments

Yildirim, PRL 101, 057010 (2008), Si and Abrahams, PRL 101, 057010 (2008)



So far dichotomy:

Fermi surface physics

Weak correlations Itinerant electrons No local moments

Mott physics

Strong correlations Localized electrons Local Moments

Hund physics

Strong correlations Local moments Itinerant electrons

> ↓ Hund metal

(new concept)

Important role, not only in iron superconductors but also in multi-orbital oxides and other systems

Haule & Kotliar NJP 11,025021 (2009) Werner et al, PRL 101, 166404 (2008), de Medici et al, PRL 107, 255701 (2011) Yu & Si, PRB 86, 085104 (2012) Fanfarillo & Bascones,PRB 92, 075136 (2015)



$$H = \sum_{i,j,\gamma,\beta,\sigma} t_{i,j}^{\gamma,\beta} c_{i,\gamma,\sigma}^{\dagger} c_{j,\beta,\sigma} + h.c. + U \sum_{j,\gamma} n_{j,\gamma,\uparrow} n_{j,\gamma,\downarrow}$$

$$+ (U' - \frac{J_{\rm H}}{2}) \sum_{j,\gamma>\beta,\sigma,\tilde{\sigma}} n_{j,\gamma,\sigma} n_{j,\beta,\tilde{\sigma}} - 2J_{\rm H} \sum_{j,\gamma>\beta} \vec{S}_{j,\gamma} \vec{S}_{j,\beta}$$

$$+ J' \sum_{j,\gamma\neq\beta} c_{j,\gamma,\uparrow}^{\dagger} c_{j,\gamma,\downarrow}^{\dagger} c_{j,\beta,\downarrow} c_{j,\beta,\uparrow} + \sum_{j,\gamma,\sigma} \epsilon_{\gamma} n_{j,\gamma,\sigma}$$

$$Hund's coupling$$

$$U' = U - 2J_{\rm H} \quad J' = J_{\rm H}$$

6 electrons (undoped)



Strong correlations between electrons (large mass enhancement) due to Hund's rule coupling. Large local spin moments.

But electrons can hop between neighboring atoms.

Orbital decoupling: Different orbitals present different strength.









icmm

CSIC

From analysis of: ARPES, Neutron & Xray experiments, Quantum oscillations, Comparison with theory ...

Review: Bascones, Valenzuela, Calderón, Comptes Rendus Physique 17, 36 (2016)

Mott transition. Paramagnetic state. DMFT picture. 1band



Increasing interaction

Infinite dimensions

Georges et al , RMP 68, 13 (1996)

icmm

CSIC

Correlations in iron superconductors



Watson et al, arXiv:1612.02676; Evtushinsky et al, arXiv:1612.02313

CSIC
Correlations and doping



Correlations increase when the filling approaches half-filling (Mott insulator)





Correlations in iron superconductors as a function of doping

Theory



Fig: Pizarro, Calderón, Liu, Muñoz, Bascones, PRB in press (2017)

Correlations increase towards the half-filled Mott insulator (n=5)

Ishida& Liebsch, PRB 82, 1551006 (2010) Werner et al, Nature Phys. 8, 331 (2012) Calderon et al, PRB 90, 115128 (2014) de Medici et al, PRL 112, 177001 (2014)

icmm

CSIC

Correlations in iron superconductors as a function of doping



Courtesy, Ming Yi, UC Berkeley (ARPES)



A new way to look at the phase diagram of iron superconductors











Increasing correlations (experimental & theoretical evidence)









Two superconducting domes in LaFeAsO_{1-x} H_x

Substitution of oxygen by hidrogen dopes the FeAs layer with electrons



Moon et al, arXiv:1612.05520



Hund metal: Correlations induced by Hund's rule & U. Local moments but itinerant electrons. Orbital decoupling

 Correlations increase with hole-doping towards the half-filled Mott insulator.
The phase diagram revisited. Connection with cuprates





icmm

CSIC

□ The electronic filling determines the correlation but the lattice is also important

Ordered phases: spin and orbital interplay



Primary role of spin degrees of freedom

- Nematicity is a consequence of Magnetism
- Superconductivity induced by magnetic fluctuations

Primary role of orbital degrees of freedom

- Magnetism is a consequence of Nematicity
- Superconductivity induced by orbital fluctuations

Orbital and spin degrees of freedom are coupled difficult to disentangle who comes first



Stripe magnetism $Q=(\pi,0)$







Local moments (Heisenberg like)



 $J_2/2 > J_1$

Fe

Stripe order

Raghu et al, PRB 77, 220503 (2008), Mazin et al, PRB 78, 085104 (2008), Chubukov et al, PRB 78, 134512 (2008), Cvetkovic & Tesanovic,EPL85, 37002 (2008)

Stripe magnetism $Q=(\pi,0)$

Yildirim, PRL 101, 057010 (2008), Si and Abrahams, PRL 101, 057010 (2008)





Against this model

- Double stripe in FeTe
- Magnetic ordering in LaFeAsO_{1-x}H_x
- Energy scale of spin waves

Local moments (Heisenberg like)

$$H_{J_1-J_2} = \frac{J_1}{|S|^2} \sum_{\langle i,j \rangle} \vec{S}_i \vec{S}_j + \frac{J_2}{|S|^2} \sum_{\langle \langle i,j \rangle \rangle} \vec{S}_i \vec{S}_j.$$

 $J_2/2>J_1$

Stripe order

To explain neutrons it is necessary to include $K_{ij} \left(\mathbf{S}_i \cdot \mathbf{S}_j \right)^2$

Against this model

- C4 phase in hole-doped 122 family
- Experimental magnetic moment too low
- Signatures of itinerancy in spin waves

Review: Bascones, Valenzuela, Calderón, Comptes Rendus Physique 17, 36 (2016)







Superconductivity in iron superconductors



Origin of superconductivity?: Non conventional

Spin fluctuations

Spin fluctuations,

s[±] in FeAs undoped systems

Hirschfeld.

Scalapino, et al

d-wave in strongly doped

Fermi surface

instability

systems

Fluctuations from Localized spins

s±, d-wave gap depending on parameters

Little predictive power (no clear value of the parameters or orbital dependence)

Si et al

The superconducting order parameter changes sign in the Brillouin zone Orbital fluctuations (enhanced by phonons)

s++ in FeAs undoped systems

The superconducting order parameter **does not change sign** in the Brillouin zone

Kontani et al



Origin of superconductivity?: Non conventional



In systems with electron and hole pockets the absence of nodes points excludes d-wave



Nodes in the gap function

(specific heat, penetration length, ARPES, STM)

Table 1. Gap structures in Fe-based materials deduced from thermodynamic and transport measurements. OD=overdoped, OP=optimally doped, UD=underdoped. Symbol * indicates possible evidence for "*c*-axis nodes".

Family	Full gap	Highly anisotropic	Strong nodal
1111	$PrFeAsO_{1-y}[52K]$ [293] SmFeAs(O,F)[55K] [295]	LaFeAs(O,F)[26K] [214] NdFeAs(O,F) [214]	LaFePO[6K] [203, 204, 294]
122	$\begin{array}{c} (\mathrm{Ba},\mathrm{K})\mathrm{Fe}_{2}\mathrm{As}_{2}[40\mathrm{K}] \ [146,\ 236,\ 296,\ 242] \\ \mathrm{Ba}(\mathrm{Fe},\mathrm{Co})_{2}\mathrm{As}_{2} \ [\mathrm{OP},\!23\mathrm{K}] \ [238,\ 208] \end{array}$	$\begin{array}{c} {\rm Ba(Fe,Co)_2As_2\ [OD]\ [238,\ 241]^*} \\ {\rm Ba(Fe,Ni)_2As_2\ [297]^*} \\ {\rm Ba(Fe,Co)_2As_2\ [UD]\ [241]^*} \end{array}$	$\begin{array}{c} {\rm KFe_2As_2} \ [4{\rm K}] \ [211, \ 309] \\ {\rm BaFe_2(As,P)_2[OP,31{\rm K}]} \ [205, \ 149] \\ {\rm (Ba,K)Fe_2As_2} \ [{\rm UD}] \ [242] \end{array}$
111	LiFeAs [18K] [298, 258]		LiFeP [6K] [299]
11		Fe(Se,Te) [27K] [231, 246]	

Excludes d-wave in these systems

Differences among materials:

The order parameter in some materials presents nodes but in other materials it is nodeless

Hirschfeld, Korshunov, Mazin, Rep. Prog. Phys 74, 124508 (2011)



Sign change of the order parameter vs Absence of sign change

□ Many experiments measure the magnitude of the order parameter but not the sign

□ No definitive experiment contrary to what happened in cuprates with d-wave

s±

Supported by many experiments (neutron resonance, Josephson junctions, QPI from STM, **localized states around nonmagnetic impurities** in STM) Early supported by the effect of disorder on the gap.

S++

Role of disorder revisited

Hirschfeld, Comptes Rendus Physique 17, 197 (2016)



□ The symmetry of the order parameter seems consistent with predictions from spin fluctuations theory of superconductivity

□ Most probably s± in undoped FeAs systems, it can be d-wave in some electron doped chalcogenides and in (strongly hole-doped) KFe_2As_2

□ Not clear whether the spin fluctuations come from itinerant or localized spins.

□ Generic agreement, but still some inconsistencies between theory (itinerant) and experiment with the k-dependent amplitude of the order parameter.

icmm

CSIC



nodal s_+

 s_{\pm}

d

Absence of superconductivity in the germanides



Isostructural and isovalent FeGe compounds not superconducting or maybe with very low Tc

Absence of superconductivity in the germanides





Guterding, Jeschke, Mazin, Glasbenner, Bascones, Valenti, PRL 118, 017204 (2017) Iron superconductors: FeAs, FeSe layers

What about systems with FeGe layers?



Isostructural and isovalent FeGe compounds not superconducting or maybe with very low Tc

Ferromagnetic tendencies in FeGe! Non trivial role of cation states





A structural transition precedes the antiferromagnetic phase in many compounds a≠b



Tetragonal symmetry broken

Very strong anisotropic electronic properties on spite of a very small lattice change (resistivity, optical conductivity, neutrons, ARPES, ...)













Gallais & Paul, Comptes Rendus Physique 17, 113 (2016)

icmm

CSIC















(controversial) ARPES experiments which suggest unconventional order

icmm

CSIC



icmm

CSIC

Fanfarillo, Giovannetti, Capone, Bascones, arXiv: 1609.06672

Ordered phases: spin and orbital interplay





Other issues

- □ Quantum criticality. Evidence of AF criticality in BaFe2(As_{1-x}P_x)₂ at optimal doping. Lack of effect in Tc of critical nematicity in FeSe_{1-x}S_x
- Monolayer or few layer FeSe on STO or other substrates. Tc enhancement and non-trivial role of doping.
- Disorder: non-universal suppression of Tc, effect on the gap, localized bound states, QPI, nucleation of magnetic clusters, effect on nematicity ...
- □ The experimental Fermi surface: spin fluctuations, non-local effect of interactions.
- □ BCS vs BEC crossover in FeSe
- Three-dimensionality and the folded Brillouin zone (possible UC pairing states)
- □ Spin-orbit coupling



Future prospects: Search for high-Tc in Chromium materials





Future prospects: Search for high-Tc in Chromium materials





Superconductivity, if present, most probably d-wave

Pizarro, Calderón, Liu, Muñoz, Bascones, PRB in press (2017)



9 years of iron superconductors: what we have learnt

- □ 11 families of FeAs or FeSe based superconductors. FeSe in monolayer form. High-Tc superconductivity seems absent in FeGe systems
- □ Superconductivity, magnetism and nematicity present in the phase diagram, which is nonuniversal (nematicity w/wout AF, two domes, different magnetic orders ...)
- Key developments in understanding multi-orbital & multi-band systems. Hund's coupling.
- □ Correlations. Hund metal physics: high-spin, itinerancy, orbital decoupling. Increase of correlations approaching the half-filled Mott insulator (n=5)-connection with cuprates physics. Role of the lattice. Not clear yet the best starting point for effective models.
- Not clear the nature of magnetism (itinerancy, but some states not explained by nesting). Double exchange physics?
- □ Superconductivity most probably mediated by antiferro-magnetic fluctuations. Order parameter most probably s± FeAs systems with electron & hole pockets (both nodal & nodeless examples) and d-wave in systems with only electron or only hole-pockets.
- Structural transition is electronic, most probably Ising-spin nematic in FeAs systems, but could be of orbital nature in FeSe. Hund's physics opposes onsite ferro-orbital ordering.
 Spin fluctuations could lead to sign changing orbital order.



Thanks

Instituto de Ciencia de Materiales de Madrid



M. J. Calderón



J.M. Pizarro



G. León (Industry)



B. Valenzuela



L. Fanfarillo (Trieste)



M.C. Muñoz



J. Liu (Shadong)

Other institutions

M. Capone, G. Giovanetti (Trieste) L. De Medici (Grenoble) R. Valenti, D. Guterding, H. Jeschke (Frankfurt)I. Mazin, R. Glasbenner (Naval Research Laboratory)

